

**General Topics :: Compilations are ILLEGAL?****Compilations are ILLEGAL? - posted by MisterCheez (), on: 2006/8/23 15:12**

Hi all,  
I'm highly concerned that the incredible compilations such as "The Revival Hymn" are illegal. The issue is not whether they are being resold, it is the copyright on the content used.

Most pastors who allow their sermons to be freely reproduced ask but one thing, that the sermon be maintained as a whole. Otherwise, a sermon reproduced in part could be used to support almost any message the reproducer has in mind. The last thing a pastor needs is a well meaning (or malicious) "comper" to butcher context and tarnish a valid whole. The sum of their words may have been the intended truth.

Additionally, much of the fancy music on the compilations is being enjoyed without a sale to the creator. Not to mention, most CDs these days have an anti-piracy warning strictly forbidding copying in any form.

Don't get me wrong, I love compilations. Yet, are we turning a blind eye to the obvious disobedience to authority and even stealing? Can anyone defend compilations with a sound argument besides the normal stammerings most people use to justify stealing copyrighted music? "I'm not making a profit" or "The original author is Christian" won't cut it.

Sorry to drop the bomb. I'm waiting to hear responses before trashing my collection of comps...

**Re: Compilations are ILLEGAL?, on: 2006/8/23 15:21**

I could be wrong here, but I believe the only way it would be illegal is if the preacher has a copyright on the material he is making available. In other words, if he is putting out material... recorded or otherwise... and doesn't have a copyright on it, it is fair game.

I have written material in the past, and I have kept it under wraps until such time as I had a copyright. If I didn't, and someone used the material as their own, there is nothing I can do about it.

As believers, we should not be stealing others messages, songs, material etc... copyrights or no copyrights. I don't believe compilations can be considered "stealing" unless there is some sort of financial gain, or the person using it is claiming it for their own credit.

Krispy

**Re: - posted by KingJimmy (), on: 2006/8/23 16:46**

I'm no legal expert, but I think compilations are legal if they are used for "educational purposes."

**Re: - posted by sermonindex (), on: 2006/8/23 16:55**

I think that if the compilations are given for free then there is a sense of it being used in "fair use". the permissions for all the speakers and the right use of the sermons are not in question but rather the music behind some of the compilations. Not all compilations use music that is sold. But for the one's that are it would have to be left with each individual person's conscience. The Revival Hymn and a few other compilations I really believe have an encouragement for the body of Christ and is not done that professionally, personally I think it is fair use for personal use on people's computers.

I know some people that have started to ensure that their compilations have "non-copyright" music on it or music that is not being sold. I think that is the best way to progress. I have asked a brother recently that made a very good compilation to take out the music, I would rather have a copy up on the site that has just vocals or light "permission" based music in the background.

**General Topics :: Compilations are ILLEGAL?**

**Re: - posted by Compton (), on: 2006/8/23 18:59**

"Fair Use" is a defense, but it is a very limited one. If a copyright holder wanted to challenge the use of their music in a compilation I don't think Fair Use would be a reliable defense. I believe the system would regard compilations as entertainment or self expression, rather than educational or even parody.

See this link for ([http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Fair\\_use](http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Fair_use)) Fair Use

The issue of damages, or legal remedies are completely separate...since compilations have no commercial value it may be simply a matter of pulling the infringement.

One thing to consider is contacting the labels and artists that own these recordings and getting their permission for non-profit application. You might be pleasantly surprised. I had a friend who obtained permission from Michael W. Smith's people to use the instrumental music "Ashton" on a video presentation for a surgeon's conference.

In the very least, if you found out that the copyright holder would not want you to use their music, wouldn't that pretty much speak to your conscience about the right and wrongness of using their music?

MC

**Re: - posted by Compton (), on: 2006/8/23 19:10**

One more idea related to compilations...

Perhaps some people could try building semi-custom tracks in powerful and inexpensive programs like Garageband for Mac :-D or Acid for PC :-). These programs use royalty-free bits of professional music that can be layered very easily. There is a little more work and cost, but the benefit is that you can alter the music tracks with more control to fit your voice-overs more exactly.

MC

**Re: Compilations are ILLEGAL?, on: 2006/8/24 2:44**

Dear Brother,

I started making my compilations at the leading of the Holy Spirit, and I made them for me first and then I made them (hopefully) to edify the Body of Believers. You can find them at [fireonthealtar.com](http://fireonthealtar.com) in the compilations section under "Neil G." As I progressed I stopped using preachers' sermons and began to use audio passages of Scripture.

It wasn't over any perceived copyright infringement that I stopped using sermons, it was that I found audio Scriptures were meat, and the Audio Scripture I use is free by Stephen Johnston whose reading of the Word I enjoy so much, his voice is soft and meek.

I did one comp, called a "Kingdom of Priests", for my son to explain WHO we are in Christ. Our favorite movie is Lord of the Rings, and I used an elvish theme as the musical thru line. Now if Peter Jackson and Howard Shore want me to remove them, I will do so in a second. But I'll tell you this, when I feel cold and wondering who I am in Christ, I pray listening to that comp whilst on my knees and weep with joy at God's gift, and feel no conviction of sin.

Respectful advice? If a Christian artist is living where God wants him to, and a believer uses his music to help edify the Body, they will be rejoicing and honored, so don't trash your collection, get on your knees while you listen to it.

You're not dropping a bomb, just sensitive.

My favorite comps that the Lord gave me to craft are "Hosanna", "Dwell", "Worship in your way" and "As We Are One".

They edify me, and that's what the Lord wanted for me.

**General Topics :: Compilations are ILLEGAL?**

**Re: - posted by philologos (), on: 2006/8/24 9:56**

Quote:  
-----the Audio Scripture I use is free by Stephen Johnston whose reading of the Word I enjoy so much, his voice is soft and meek.  
-----

...tell me more, please.

**Re:, on: 2006/8/24 10:11**

Bartle...

I would caution you to be careful when using audio scripture. The only version of the Bible that does NOT have a copyright on it is the KJV. All other versions have copyrights, and you need permission of the owner to reproduce any portions thereof.

The KJV you can use freely... as scripture should be!

Krispy

**Re: Compilations are ILLEGAL? - posted by hmmhmm (), on: 2006/8/24 10:20**

I've made one compilation before, I was so moved by Keith Daniel that I made a compilation, then Greg told me he had received a letter from Keith Daniel where he says he didn't want people to use his voice like that, so I erased it. Now if that person or company who own the copyright to these background music would say something I would erase that one too, then I don't know of all the rules, since I make the compilation in Sweden.... I know some laws here you can't copy it and use it for your own personal profit, or claim it is you who made it, but I know I can download anything that's been shown on TV for example, it's not illegal to record songs played on the radio. and since I don't do compilation for personal profit or for any organization's profit I see it to be OK, but if I'm wrong I will change it... I'll try to find out who I can ask it to be OK, and for that comp Greg uploaded here I'm working on a version without music that now is almost done... or maybe one without some music that is free to use. So maybe people can choose what version they feel OK with until we know for sure .... or have permission to use it..I'm thinking of sending some mails and see what the response will be

God's peace to you  
Christian

**Re: Ron Bailey, on: 2006/8/24 13:49**

My British brother, here's the link to the audio Bible I use:

<http://www.audiotreasure.com/webindex.htm>

May God bless you RICHLY today is my prayer, Bartle

ps...its David Williams that reads it....my elevator doesn't go to the top floor all the time,

**Re: Compilations are ILLEGAL? What does the law say? - posted by Saddened, on: 2006/8/24 15:39**

There is a lot of speculation about copyright laws, but no real evidence. It seems like it is easier for someone to "ask for forgiveness" if we ignorantly infringe on someone's copyright, then it is to ask for permission, because that takes a lot of work.

According to the US Copyright Office (<http://www.copyright.gov/>):

"Do I have to register with your office to be protected?"

"No. In general, registration is voluntary. Copyright exists from the moment the work is created. You will have to register, however, if you wish to bring a lawsuit for infringement of a U.S. work."

**General Topics :: Compilations are ILLEGAL?**

and

"What does copyright protect?

"Copyright, a form of intellectual property law, protects original works of authorship including literary, dramatic, musical, and artistic works, such as poetry, novels, movies, songs, computer software, and architecture. Copyright does not protect facts, ideas, systems, or methods of operation, although it may protect the way these things are expressed."

Therefore sermons and music would hold copyrights, whether registered or not. It seems to me that whenever we manipulate sermons into compilations, add background music without permission even for the "edification of the body" we are breaking US Copyright Law. God has called us to obey the laws of the government in his word. It does not matter how good the intent is, the law of God supercedes good intent.

Even as I write this I stand guilty, so after I post this I need to go delete a clipped version of one of the sermons I downloaded and go home and throw away the compilation sermon. Beware lest we harden our hearts against the conviction of the Holy Spirit and rationalize our sins.

Brothers and sisters let us confront our sins that we might walk in holiness, and thank God that conviction through His word.

Let us be men and women of integrity.

**Re: Compilations are ILLEGAL? - posted by Andrew\_Strom, on: 2006/8/24 16:25**

My name is Andrew Strom, and just to add to this discussion from a "preacher's" perspective - I LOVE compilations. I think they are a great invention.

My preaching has been used in a number of compilations on the Internet - and I do not mind at all - in fact I think anything new that gets the message out is a good thing. I don't mind at all that my preaching is "chopped up" - and I have never yet found one that is objectionable. I am sure almost all preachers would feel the same way. So go for it, people!

Regarding the "music" situation - yes this is a little dicey using 'comercial' music. But I have studied "Fair Use" a little - and probably the comps are OK if they are free on the Internet. But it is better to find some 'Copyright-free' loops or music if possible.

All in all, I encourage everyone to make MORE comps - not less!! If you want some fiery sermons to "chop up" and use, then feel free to come to-  
<http://www.revivalschool.com> -and use our MP3 sermons there - or whatever you like.

God bless you all.

Andrew Strom.

**Re: - posted by sermonindex (), on: 2006/8/24 16:53**

Quote:  
-----Even as I write this I stand guilty, so after I post this I need to go delete a clipped version of one of the sermons I downloaded and go home and throw away the compilation sermon. Beware lest we harden our hearts against the conviction of the Holy Spirit and rationalize our sins.  
-----

I don't think that the clipping of sermons is in question in this thread but rather the music behind them. For most of the speakers I have full permission to use them freely. Some speakers such as: Keith Daniel and David Legge do not want their voices clipped into compilations and that is being respected and adhered to.

Quote:  
-----Regarding the "music" situation - yes this is a little dicey using 'comercial' music. But I have studied "Fair Use" a little - and probably the comps are OK if they are free on the Internet. But it is better to find some 'Copyright-free' loops or music if possible.  
-----

**General Topics :: Compilations are ILLEGAL?**

I agree Andrew. Great to see you on the site discussion board, feel free to post comments more if you feel led. I am not sure if you are aware Andrew, that there is a great compilation with some clips of your sermons in them:

So Great A Salvation - Part 1 (compilation)

So Great A Salvation - Part 2 (compilation)

Andrew Strom's sermons can be found here on SI:

<http://www.sermonindex.net/modules/mydownloads/viewcat.php?cid=520>

**Re: - posted by Compton (), on: 2006/8/24 17:04**

Hello Andrew,

After hearing and reading some of your sermons, it's great to see you here 'in person'!

MC

**Re: - posted by MisterCheez (), on: 2006/8/24 17:27**

Quote:

-----I don't think that the clipping of sermons is in question in this thread but rather the music behind them.  
-----

As the originator of this thread, 'yes' the clipping of the sermons and the music is in question.

Again, don't get me wrong, I'm not out to destroy compilations. I love compilations and have been moved by many of them.

My concern was, and is, that we need to be more careful when assembling compilations. Excellent content doesn't negate breaking copyright law.

I propose that those doing compilations create a centralized web page which lists pastors and musicians who have no problem with their material being used. These should be backed up with some type of proof of correspondence.

We all know a few clips from Keith Daniel set to epic music could drive just about anyone to the floor, but he does not wish for his material to be used in such a way. Is it then righteous to assume all speakers' and musicians' material is fair game unless they find out and have a dispute?

This discussion is not pleasant but are we heading toward revival and the promised land with little idols tucked into our pockets?

Compilations can be powerful and effective and I'm not suggesting forsaking them. I'm suggesting greater accountability, and maybe even guidelines (to prevent completely misrepresenting a speaker) so we aren't guilty of breaking the law and/or hurting people.

**Re: - posted by hmmhmm (), on: 2006/8/24 17:34**

well we can agree with many things...and i have now asked in e-mails permission to use the background music to the copyright owners and companies....in my compilation... and since all the speakers in them have passed on to eternity i feel it would be ok to use their voices.

and if it would turn out for my comp it wouldn't be ok to use the music i will not, and just in case im working on a "music free" version....but if anyone know of some copyrightfree music webpage or something similar it would be great...

god's peace to you  
christian

**General Topics :: Compilations are ILLEGAL?**

**Re: - posted by Andrew\_Strom, on: 2006/8/24 19:01**

As I said, as a preacher whose sermons are used sometimes in compilations - I really think we need to encourage the concept more. Because the devil is out there using every form of media for evil day and night. In a very real sense we are "competing" for the hearts and minds of this generation.

Yes, by all means use "copyright-free" music if possible. However, apart from 2 specific preachers who are named in this thread, I believe that all preachers living and dead should be assumed to \*WANT\* the word that they have brought to go out in any and all ways possible. I certainly wish to see anointed preaching go further and further - and personally I am fine with 'clips' being taken to do that. I believe we need to assume the same of all preachers - unless we are told otherwise.

Else this is going to put a "damper" on something new and exciting that God wants to do to reach this generation. There is nothing worse than losing a 'weapon' for good - when we need every weapon we can get. Please do not go "overboard" and kill the whole 'comp' concept by making it too hard to make them easily. I believe that is playing right into the devil's hands.

-Andrew Strom.

**Re: Compilations are ILLEGAL?, on: 2006/8/24 21:25**

Hello brothers and sisters, I have been wanting to set up an account for a while, so here I am with my first post. I began creating comps a few months ago and did quite a bit of investigation into the legal issues addressed here. I also handle the copyrights and patents for my department at work, though I am far from an expert.

All that to say section 107 of the US copyright act was specifically created and designed to allow clips of copyrighted material to be used in new works without infringing on the original work it was clipped from. This of course would not cover a whole song used as background music, but would cover the sermon clips (which belong to the Lord anyway).

If a song is available for free download on the internet and has no copyright restriction notice I have used it as background music, though I will rethink this based on comments made in this thread.

Quote:

-----  
Under section 107, the fair use of a copyrighted work is not copyright infringement, even if such use technically violates section 106. While fair use explicitly applies to use of copyrighted work for criticism, news reporting, teaching, scholarship, or research purposes, the defense is not limited to these areas. The Act gives four factors to be considered to determine whether a particular use is a fair use:

the purpose and character of the use (commercial or educational, transformative or reproductive);  
the nature of the copyrighted work (fictional or factual, the degree of creativity);  
the amount and substantiality of the portion of the original work used; and  
the effect of the use upon the market (or potential market) for the original work.  
The Act was later amended to extend the fair use defense to unpublished works.

-----  
needless to say, absolutely no way are all comps illegal, and we should all research fair use before we make blanket statements. Of course the Holy Spirit convicting your conscience trumps all...

In Christ - Jim

**General Topics :: Compilations are ILLEGAL?**

**Re:, on: 2006/8/25 4:24**

I want to know what others think about this idea and Lord willing I shall create music for it. Other musicians and I can create some instrumental music and perhaps Sermonindex can make a folder of free created music that brothers and sisters have made for the use of compilations. This way comp makers can download non-copyrighted homemade-instrumental music and it can be used in comps.

I suggest there be a condition though. Whatever comps created must not include preachers such as...(a list of preachers who have requested that their sermons be not used in comps) and it must edify the saints. see Php. 4:8

What thinkest thou?

-Abraham

**Ernest O'Neill wants compilations of his sermons., on: 2006/8/25 8:10**

Ernest O'Neill loves the compilation someone made of the simple Gospel.

<http://www.sermonindex.net/modules/mydownloads/visit.php?lid=8908>

You can use any of his sermons you want!!